# Türkiye

# Istanbul

Regional Report on Lifelong Learning Policy 2023

Tamer Atabarut Serap Karabacak Elif Yıldız



\_\_\_\_\_\_

Collaborative Monitoring of Regional Lifelong Learning Policies (COMORELP) 2020-2023 Istanbul (Türkiye) – Regional Report on Lifelong Learning Policy 2023

#### **Authors**

Dr. Tamer Atabarut, Boğaziçi University Lifelong Learning Centre Dr. Serap Karabacak, General Directorate of Lifelong Learning Elif Yıldız, Boğaziçi University Lifelong Learning Centre

The report was produced as part of the project Collaborative Monitoring of Regional Lifelong Learning Policies – COMORELP 2020-1-PL01-KA204-082010.

This project has been funded with support from the European Commission under the Erasmus+ programme.



# **Table of Content**

INTRODUCTION	4
ISTANBUL REGION	6
ISTANBUL LLL STRUCTURE	8
RESULTS OF REGIONAL ASSESSMENT	11
DESIGNING POLICY	11
I. LLL in a Regional Development Strategy	11
II. Promoting and Implementing Democratic Governance within the Regional LLL System	12
III. Inter-Institutional Coordination and Integration of LLL Policies	14
IV. Identifying Learner Needs and Monitoring Participation	15
V. International Comparisons, Cooperation and Learning	19
VI. Managing and Sustaining Partnerships	19
IMPLEMENTATION	21
VII. Information and Guidance	21
VIII. Developing Learning Motivation and Skills or Creating a Culture of LLL	22
IX. Professionalisation of Educators and LLL Staff	23
X. Promoting Demand	24
XI. Online Learning	25
XII. Supporting LLL	26
XIII. Valuing Learning	27
MONITORING AND EVALUATION	28
XIV. Capacity to Evaluate Results, Progresses and Impact of Regional LLL Policies	28
WEBOGRAPHY	30
ADDENIDIV	22

# Introduction

At a time when formal learning systems are unable to adapt to rapid change, lifelong learning has become more important than ever for learners to access up-to-date information. Rapid changes in the quality of information required by the age and technological developments have led to a focus on increasing the impact of lifelong learning as a complementary learning system.

Components such as the scope, boundaries, quality, strategies, joint work of partners, needs of beneficiaries, monitoring and evaluation of lifelong learning, lifelong learning programmes and access to lifelong learning, lifelong guidance are key issues in increasing the impact of the lifelong learning system. The main dynamic in increasing the effect is to ensure the harmonisation of all components with each other. In this context, addressing the components of lifelong learning from a holistic perspective would be the right approach.

This holistic view should cover not only the lifelong learning (LLL) components within the countries themselves, but also the systems in EU countries at certain points. This will enable countries to exchange shared knowledge, skills, or human resources. In this context, although there are regional differences, it is possible to say that the common aim of all LLL systems is to train qualified human resources and increase social welfare.

The first step towards the realisation of LLL objectives is the determination of learning requirements. Given the fact that the participation of the target group in learning is largely on voluntary basis and that participation in learning activities that are unlikely to produce added value is low, it is necessary to first identify the learning requirements and structure the activities in accordance with this context. Decision-makers and policymakers are expected to fulfil their responsibilities in making LLL activities widespread, dynamic, and sustainable based on the learning requirements of the actors in the system.

The dynamism and sustainability of the activities are related to their quality. Quality is the level at which a service or a product meets the needs of the beneficiary. In this context, the more the requirements are met, the more likely it is that the product or service will be used again. This process proceeds by continuously monitoring and improving the quality of the product or service with quality assurance systems. The quality of LLL activities is tracked through components in monitoring and evaluation

systems and quality assurance processes. This process includes topics such as evaluation of learning, information, and guidance in the field of LLL, evaluation of national and international cooperation, quality of LLL programmes, evaluation of educators and administrations who are the LLL actors. The most crucial step is the evaluation of the quality of learning outcomes. The picture of the impact of the assessed learning outcomes on the training of qualified human resources and increasing social welfare, which are the priorities of LLL, is the road map for the next step of LLL.

In conclusion, lifelong learning is a collection of components. It is a complete process that can be progressed with the active participation of all actors, from decision-makers to policy makers, from implementers to programme developers, from trainers to managers. This report discusses the general situation regarding the content, activities, functions, tools of these components and tries to provide detailed information as well as a road map on the components within the scope of the project. It is among the goals of the report to create a foresight for different studies in the field of lifelong learning in the future.

# **Istanbul Region**

Istanbul is a major city in Turkey that straddles Europe and Asia across the Bosporus Strait. Even if Istanbul does not have a specific regional lifelong learning strategy, it may mostly reflect how the LLL operates in Türkiye, since the city holds many different institutions, variety of education and job opportunities. It is also a region possessing different cultures and getting affected from changing trends easily. Due to the needs of the age, especially because of the need for people outside the formal education system to keep up with a world of rapid technological and demographic change, Istanbul has also evolved in terms of LLL vision and opportunities. The participation of these people in lifelong learning has become an important indicator of social welfare and qualified employment.



Figure 1. Regions of Türkiye and the Istanbul Region

Lifelong learning is not a new concept in our country. The environment where learning and teaching are recognised as valuable has persisted for many years. However, as mentioned before, with the impact of the changes in needs, lifelong learning in Türkiye

has been systematically updated in contexts such as conception, scope, financing, policies, and decision-making.

Updating activities gained momentum especially after 2000 and Türkiye's lifelong learning participation rates have increased steadily since the same year. To sustain this increase, lifelong learning strategy documents were prepared under the coordination of the Ministry of National Education and evaluation reports were prepared by monitoring the realisation of the activities in the strategy documents at certain intervals.

# **Istanbul LLL Structure**

While countries are trying to structure a lifelong learning system that coincides with the requirements of their own societies in this fast-changing environment, they are also trying to realize the lifelong learning goals in the top policy documents of institutions such as the European Union or the OECD. The goals in international documents are especially important in terms of training human resources to realize the goals of economic development and to compete in the international market. In this context, the structure of lifelong learning systems is also a combination of both national and international requirements. Among the application areas of lifelong learning in Türkiye in the recent period are the following topics:

- → to conduct studies, implement, monitor, and evaluate them to extend education and training in a lifelong manner, apart from compulsory education,
- → to conduct non-formal education and training and open education services,
- → to provide education and training in general or vocational and technical education fields through non-formal education to citizens who have not entered the formal education system, who have left or completed any level of education,
- → to function as a bridge in ensuring the harmony between the education system and the labour market
- > promotion of entrepreneurial culture
- information and communication technologies required by working life,
- foreign language,
- financial literacy,
- problem solving,
- critical thinking,
- communication,
- leadership,
- → to gain basic skills such as career planning and job search.

To ensure the participation of adults in these lifelong learning activities, the following priorities have been identified and implemented:

- creating a culture and awareness of lifelong learning in society,
- increasing opportunities and provision of lifelong learning,
- → increasing access to lifelong learning opportunities,
- → improving lifelong guidance and counselling system,
- improving the system of recognition of prior learning,

→ developing lifelong learning, monitoring and evaluation system.

The target audience of lifelong learning in Türkiye is similar to those in the European Union in terms of its goals and stakeholders. The common aim is to develop the knowledge, skills, interests, and competences of individuals, considering their individual, communal, social and employment needs. Countries use different strategies or partnership structures to ensure this development. In this sense, among the institutions and organisations that conduct lifelong learning activities in Türkiye include public institutions and organisations, non-governmental organisations, municipalities, universities, and companies.

Lifelong learning activities are first opened in the buildings of public education centres. There is at least one public education centre in each province. After the public education centres, activities are conducted in the buildings and facilities belonging to real persons, private sector, and non-governmental organisations, which are determined to be suitable in terms of physical conditions, safety, health, and similar contexts.

Institutions have a number of databases in which they record their learning activities. For example, the data of operations and procedures of the General Directorate of Lifelong Learning of the Ministry of National Education regarding the trainings in public education centres are collected through the e-Yaygın system. The data on the system are retrieved from the system once a year and monitoring and evaluation reports on the realisation of the activities in the lifelong strategy document, development plans and MoNE strategy document are published.

Expenses related to the financing of lifelong learning are covered by public resources, private sector grants and international projects or protocols. The public resources used are divided into resources allocated to the Ministries, referred to as the general budget, and resources allocated to the units under the Ministries. Under the Law No. 5018, requests for expenditure from public resources are made through the "Budget Management and Information System (Bütçe Yönetim ve Enformasyon Sistemi)" and some of the public resources are used in lifelong learning activities within this scope. Budget allocations include personnel expenses, centre expenses, social or cultural activities.

National and international indicators, agreements, development goals, changing social structure and demographic structure are among the important determinants in the development of policies for lifelong learning. Especially after the recent COVID-19 pandemic, it has become an agenda that epidemics in the global context are among the dynamics affecting lifelong learning as one of the factors that transform societies.

The parties of the mentioned top policy documents are also the groups that determine the direction of lifelong learning. In particular, people in employment who are out of formal education and the sectors in which these people are involved and every sector that needs qualified workforce constitute an important driving force. In summary, every unit that somehow comes into contact with people who are out of formal education conducts lifelong learning activities and influences decision-makers in this sense. Recently, the fact that fields such as software expertise and robotic coding have wide employment opportunities globally has shifted the direction of lifelong learning activities in this direction. New programmes such as coding activities have been added to lifelong learning programmes as the society communicated their training demands in this field to the relevant units.

Strengths	Weaknesses	Opportunities	Threads
Diversity and prevalence of courses within the scope of lifelong learning.  Legislation allowing cooperation with the industry.  Availability of diversity to meet interests and needs.  Many institutions are LLL actors in the region (universities, municipalities, ministries, corporations, nongovernmental organizations).	Low awareness of activities within the scope of lifelong learning.  Coordination and partnership among the institutions must be enhanced.  Data-driven policy development and lack of an integrated data system.  Vertical communication in management processes.  the supervisory mechanism.	Contribution of the private sector to the planning and implementation processes of vocational education.  Having a central public body to rely on and follow the action plans if an initiative starts.	Migration.  Population movements and rapid change in urbanization.

**Table 1.** SWOT Analysis of the Istanbul Region

**Results of Regional Assessment** 

# **Designing Policy**

# I. LLL in a Regional Development Strategy

Question		Answer
Is lifelong learning an important development plan or of the	_	Yes

Table 2. Question 1

In addition to the development goals, lifelong learning has a key place in strengthening individuals, families, and society in general in the face of social changes. Lifelong learning programmes prepared and updated aim to achieve these objectives. Public education centres for disabled adults, which have been opened in some provinces to ensure the participation of disabled adults in social life, and village community centres, which have been opened in some regions to provide training to create employment (in areas such as beekeeping), are trying to achieve regional social welfare and development goals by increasing vocational skills.

With the "Good practices" initiative, it is ensured that other institutions and organisations in the field of lifelong learning across the country share their good practices and exchange information with each other.

While the data within the system, where numerical data on lifelong learning activities are collected, are used for interim reporting, the monitoring and evaluation reports prepared once a year and shared with the public provide vital information on the general situation of lifelong learning.

To understand the progress, impact, and level of implementation of the practices, the centres make data entries through the quality monitoring system of the Ministry of National Education. The reports prepared after the data analyses enable the quality processes in lifelong learning institutions to be monitored. In addition, in general, it is aimed to reach adults all over the country by creating distance learning opportunities.

To increase the number of people with access, efforts are made to increase the number of projects and protocols in the field of lifelong learning at the same rate. Projects with national and international funding and protocols with local and international institutions and organisations are important in this sense. Some documents prepared in this context, applications and links are listed below:

In the field of lifelong learning, a considerable number of activities are conducted to reach different target groups in different subjects. Once the national lifelong monitoring system (UHBIS, Ulusal Hayat Boyu İzleme Sistemi), which has been included in the Presidential activity programme and is still in the process of being finalised, becomes operational, large-scale assessments and policies on lifelong learning activities will be developed more effectively. Additionally, effective policies can be formulated with data collected according to certain criteria. In this sense, data collection systems are essential.

The dynamic nature of lifelong learning is undeniable. This dynamism is inevitable for any system whose primary focus is human beings. This is because humans are by nature ever-changing beings. In this regard, it is necessary to diversify the activities mentioned in the previous section and to organise some activities without focusing only on employment. Especially with the rapid introduction of artificial intelligence and machine learning processes into our daily lives and sectors, how people should be prepared for the future in these two topics or how the future should be prepared for those people is one of the issues that should be studied in the field of lifelong learning.

#### **Conclusions**

- → The problem of monitoring and evaluation of these activities on a national scale has not been fully resolved.
- → Lifelong Learning Policies are one of the important factors considered in sustainable development of the country but even if the regional actors operate aiming regional development, the regional policy is missing.
- → It is among the recommendations to identify and implement strategies that will enable monitoring and evaluation processes to be conducted more functionally.

# II. Promoting and Implementing Democratic Governance within the Regional LLL System

Que	stion	Answer
2.	Are stakeholders, learners and educators involved in the governance system of LLL (or specific education sectors)	Yes

#### Table 3. Question 2

To ensure the communication of the components within the lifelong learning system or the communication of data with each other, firstly, the data should be collected in a common pool on a system such as UHBİS or made accessible to partners through a database. Currently, this is being done through the e-Government (e-Devlet) system under certain categories. It is therefore important and necessary for individuals or relevant institutions and organisations to have access to the necessary data in the areas covered by their mandate.

Activities, such as good practice examples, and their results are shared publicly. Such sharing is important both for the organisations to be aware of each other's activities and for the potential participants of LLL to access information.

Within the scope of good practice examples, the selection of examples is made according to the evaluation criteria determined by the institutions themselves to share inspiring original examples with everyone and to serve as a reference for novel studies. For institutions affiliated to GDLLL of MoNE, this process starts with sending the best practices of the districts to the district education directorates to which they are affiliated. The examples selected by the commissions established in the districts were sent to the provincial directorates of national education, and after the selections made here, the examples found appropriate in the province were sent to the Ministry, and after the selection made by the commission established in the Ministry, the most remarkable examples are shared via the internet. For 2021, 10 different good practices were identified and short videos regarding these good practices were published.

The involvement of lifelong learning partners in management processes is particularly facilitated in the context of <u>vocational skills development and vocational</u> <u>programmes</u>. The process involves sector representatives, non-governmental organisations or trade unions submitting their requests (to MoNE) to the relevant ministries or institutions for the training of employees, followed by the preparation and implementation of training programmes in line with the request. In provinces and districts, this process proceeds more or less in the same way. From time to time, the process moves from the Ministry or the central administration to the provinces and districts, while there are requests from provinces and districts as well. The processes of communicating requests (legislation, assignment, etc.) and including different partners in the processes can be done through the communication systems of the units (such as e-Yaygın system or KTS) or through a general communication system covering the whole country, such as CIMER (Presidency's Communication Centre). Considering that the processes conducted through these systems are also monitored and evaluated, it

can be said that the parties to lifelong learning participate in governance processes quite effectively through these systems.

#### **Conclusions**

- → The communication of actors in LLL governance is mostly managed by collecting data on platforms.
- → In terms of different kind of communication, the process can be initiated by the Ministry or the central administration to the provinces and districts, or it can be vice versa.
- → There are the main communication systems of the units (such as e-Yaygın system or KTS) general communication system covering the whole country, such as CIMER (Presidency's Communication Centre).

# III. Inter-Institutional Coordination and Integration of LLL Policies

Que	stion	Answer
3.	Does a lifelong learning policy exist at regional level? covering all education sectors (see below)?	No
4.	Does a lifelong learning policy cover all education sectors (see below)?	Yes
	a) formal	Yes
	b) informal	Yes
	c) all age groups	Yes
5.	Is there cooperation and coordination between central and regional levels?	Yes
	a) financial	Yes
	b) administrative	Yes
	c) other	Yes

Table 4. Questions 3-5

The policies for lifelong learning and how their components are determined have been explained in the previous sections. While this policy and its components are determined to cover the whole country, it is important to ensure conformity with EUROSTAT in translating them into indicators, and accordingly, indicators are determined in the national context. In regional contexts, provinces and districts have

the autonomy to organise their education according to their own needs and dynamics, to make requests for the creation of programmes according to their needs, and to establish educational cooperation protocols. In this context, it is possible to cooperate with different institutions and organisations in line with the needs of each age group.

#### **Conclusions**

- → The LLL policy and its components are determined to cover the whole country. The policy also refers to the different segments of education and age groups.
- → The regions have the responsibility and the autonomy to determine their activities or different & specific policies (also the institution in the regions).
- → Collaboration among different institution is crucial for understanding and meeting the needs.

# IV. Identifying Learner Needs and Monitoring Participation

Que	stion	Answer
6.	Does the region monitor the participation rates in LLL; Does the region monitor emerging learning needs?	Yes
7.	How frequently does monitoring occur?	Yearly
8.	Are there tools and incentives to identify and communicate learning needs?	Yes
9.	Are organizations provided with tools and incentives to identify learning needs?	Yes

Table 5. Questions 6-9

Lifelong learning participation rates are monitored in regional and national contexts. In this sense, the data obtained from the analysis of the collected data are used to determine the lifelong learning activities of the following year.

The data that are the source of the monitoring and evaluation processes are extracted from the system each year. The data range covers the dates 1 January-31 December. For the data withdrawn from the system, analyses are made on topics such as participation rate, the most preferred programmes, the most attended course programmes regionally, participation rates by age, participation rates by gender, etc.

There are two separate tools for determining learning needs or demands. The first one is the e-Yaygın system where lifelong learners submit their course requests. The other

is the survey and field studies conducted by the institutions conducting the LLL event. For example, the General Directorate of Lifelong Learning of the Ministry of National Education conducts a study referred to as a "field survey" in September of each year. With these and similar studies, organisations collect data to determine the educational needs in their regions and to create demand.

<u>Survey studies are also among the important data collection tools</u>. With this tool, face-to-face and online information is obtained from target groups on issues such as training needs, satisfaction, etc. For example, end-of-course questionnaires are conducted for participants to evaluate the education they have received in various dimensions and to determine the courses they would like to take in the next stage.

During the studies conducted to determine the learning needs, some information is provided that will encourage the participation of potential participants in the courses. Information provided include courses where they are paid a certain amount of money from the moment they start the course, courses where it is possible to directly participate in employment upon completion of the course in accordance with the protocols conducted, and courses where they can participate without paying any fee. Such are important incentive mechanisms. Certificates obtained from the courses organised by the Ministry of National Education for adults in particular may be preferred in industries.

<u>Vehicles are allocated to the institutions to provide transport for the field studies</u> <u>conducted to identify learning needs</u>. In addition, instructors who successfully create sufficient demand open their own courses and receive remuneration in return for the lesson hours they teach.

Course requests from trainees, end-of-course questionnaires, information collected in field studies and the demands of sector partners are among the tools used to identify the needs of students and monitor the impact of participation.

<u>The lifelong learning portal</u>, which contains many components related to lifelong learning, also has functions such as participation in lifelong learning, both in terms of guidance activities and directing trainees to employment. The lifelong learning portal, which has been visibly enhanced recently, has also been integrated with the egovernment application for easy access by users.

The main page of the portal includes sub-headings under the headings "About us, learning opportunities, employment opportunities, career guidance and LLL Academy".

## 1-Under the heading "About us"

- → The Importance of Lifelong Learning
- → Lifelong Learning Portal
- Mission and Vision

# 2-Under "Learning Opportunities"

- → Non-Formal Education Programmes
- → List of non-formal education programmes
- → MoNE Courses (e-Yaygın)
- → İşkur (Turkish Employment Agency) Courses
- → Continuing Education Centres
- → Under Adult Literacy Programmes

History

**Protocols** 

Legislation

**Textbooks** 

**Educational Resources** 

**Statistics** 

Literacy map of Türkiye

- → Centres of Public Education
- → Vocational Training Centres
- → Open Education Schools
- → Higher Education
- → Education Opportunities Abroad

Euroguidance Türkiye

**Ploteus** 

Erasmus

Eurodesk

- → Barrier-Free Teaching
- → E-Learning Resources

**National Library** 

**Religious Library** 

e-Books

# 3-Under "Employment Opportunities"

- → İşkur Services
- → Open Job Vacancies
- → Unemployment Benefits
- → Short-Time Working Allowance
- → State Personnel Administration
- → Private Employment Agencies
- → E-Graduate
- → KOSGEB Entrepreneurship Opportunities

- → TOBB Entrepreneurship and Professional Development Opportunities
- → Vocational and Technical Open Education School Certificate Programme

#### 4-Under "Career Guidance"

- → Career Plan
   Career Development
   Plan Your Career Step-by-Step
   Factors Affecting Our Career Plan
- → Business World Get to Know Jobs and Professions Discover the Business World
- Psychological Counsellors for Career Career Counselling Labour Market Information Technology Utilisation Application Sources
- → Professional Competence and Professional Standards
  National Professional Standards
  National Competence
  Vocational Qualification Information Enquiry

Comprehensive information is provided on issues such as Authorised Certification Bodies. In addition, some of the national studies of the activities conducted by lifelong learning actors throughout the country in the field of lifelong learning are also included in the portal.

#### **Conclusions**

- → The participation rates are calculated in regional and national contexts through two separate tools (the e-Yaygın system and the survey & field studies).
- → With the surveys and field studies, the feedback about training needs, satisfaction, etc are also obtained by the target group.
- → Other tool is also allocated for the institutions to provide transport for the field studies conducted to identify learning needs.
- → "The lifelong learning portal" is also a useful tool for the participants that enables the access to different categories from employment to guidance.

# V. International Comparisons, Cooperation and Learning

Question	Answer
<ol> <li>Is the Region a member of an overarching association or network specifically focused on LLL or more specific education sectors (e.g., VET, adult learning, etc.)</li> </ol>	Yes
11. Are exchange learning opportunities in place?	Yes

Table 6. Questions 10-11

Within the scope of lifelong learning activities, both VET partners and lifelong learning partners are brought together. In this context, among the institutions and organisations working together and the cooperation networks are:

- → The European Commission
- → UNESCO Institute for Lifelong Learning
- → The Global Partnership for Education
- → The Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)
- → The World Bank.

Türkiye is also included in the reports published after the studies conducted by these institutions, organisations, and educational networks. In addition to these, Türkiye also participates in evaluation studies such as PIAAC and TALIS, especially for adult learners within the scope of lifelong learning.

### **Conclusions**

- → In LLL, different partners and VET actors cooperate, and the networks are listed above.
- → Besides the partnership among the governmental bodies covering the whole country, the regions, companies, institution in the regions are also cooperating and participate in networks.
- → As the focused region, Istanbul, is widely open and convenient for exchange of knowledge and best practices.

# VI. Managing and Sustaining Partnerships

Question	Answer
12. Has the regional authority promoted, supported, and achieved sustainable partnerships for lifelong learning?	Yes
13. If there are multi-stakeholder partnerships:	Yes

 Question
 Answer

 a) do they exist?
 Yes

 b) are they supported by regional authority?
 Yes

 c) are they promoted?
 Yes

 14. Are there multi-stakeholder partnerships?
 Yes

Table 7. Questions 12-14

There is no single regional power or authority in the field of lifelong learning in Türkiye. However, the realisation of regional and national targets has been assigned to institutions and organisations through high policy documents such as development plans. In addition, the Presidential Education and Training Policies Council has recently been actively shaping regional education policies.

Following the determination of works and procedures in development plans and other top policy documents, institutions and organisations create strategy documents and action plans to conduct these works and procedures. The relevant and responsible institutions and organisations in these action plans perform the necessary work to fulfil the specified works and procedures. In this sense, certain activities are organised considering regional needs. Recently, regional requirements and meeting them have become even more important in efforts to increase the number of trainees, which is approximately 8.5 million per year, to increase participation in lifelong learning.

With the effect of regional dynamics, there has been a demand for general and vocational trainings such as hygiene training for those working in the food and water sector, computer operator, decorative wood decoration, traditional hand embroidery, home textile products preparation, beekeeping, basic processes in clothing production, decorative home accessories preparation, natural gas fired heater igniter, clothes alteration, cook assistant, occupational health and safety, tailoring of women's clothing, crochet knitting, real estate consultancy, cooking apprentice, needle lace making, tailoring of women's outer garments.

A substantial number of these trainings were opened upon the requests from the regions and by considering the demands of the institutions. These trainings are organised to ensure that adults keep up with the qualified personnel demands of institutions and organisations and the changing conditions of daily life.

#### **Conclusions**

→ As stated, the regional power or authority in the field of lifelong learning in Türkiye is missing. Only the municipalities or provincial directorates of national education

- may have the authority, but they are not directly linked with LLL even if they have operations in their departments.
- → For regional and national aims, the institutions are assigned by high policy documents such as development plans.
- → After the works and procedures are defined in development plans and other top policy documents, institutions and organisations in regions work on strategy documents and action plans to conduct these works and procedures in line with the regional needs.
- → So as a conclusion, there is a multi-stakeholder partnership, and they are guided by the authorities.

# **Implementation**

# VII. Information and Guidance

Question	Answer
15. Is the information easily accessible to all, i.e., if stakeholders' specific needs are taken into account?	Yes

Table 8. Question 15

In general, the access to information in the field of LLL can be said to be easy. Here, reports and information prepared considering the special needs of partners are shared with free access. In addition, partners and researchers who want to conduct joint work, especially those who are not in the sharing, request any data or information, they can be shared with them, provided that such information is also available. Data or information requests can be made to the relevant units of the institutions. For example, requests for data regarding all institutions and organisations within the Ministry of National Education are made to the Strategy Development Department (Strategy Geliştirme Başkanlığı). Data and information are shared primarily on the web pages of institutions and organisations. In this sense, unit activity reports, annual monitoring reports, activity reports of projects are among the important data sources. Most of this information is also included in the relevant sections of TurkStat data and reports.

#### **Conclusions**

- → The access to information and statistics are easy in the field of LLL.
- → The reports on special needs of partners are all accessible for free. The partners and researchers may also request any data or information for a joint work.

→ The important data sources are listed as unit activity reports, annual reports, activity reports of projects.

# VIII. Developing Learning Motivation and Skills or Creating a Culture of LLL

Que	stion	Answer
16.	Are there awareness and promotion campaigns in place to support lifelong learning?	Yes
17.	Does the promotion of learning to learn cover all stages of life?	Not applicable
	a) children?	Yes
	b) youths?	Yes
	c) adults?	Yes
	d) seniors?	Yes

Table 9. Questions 16-17

In the lifelong learning strategy documents, the topics related to the promotion of LLL and raising awareness are among the priorities. Trainings addressing the needs of all segments of society are organised in the context of LLL. In the processes preceding the strategy documents, the MoNE Council decisions appear as the top policy documents that determine the direction of LLL.

In addition to the top policy documents, examples of good practices and public service announcements for the promotion of LLL are systematically prepared in 2–3-year intervals and broadcast during prime time. In these broadcasts, people well recognised by the public are employed as role models to reach large masses. In addition, social media accounts for LLL are among the tools used to raise awareness in this sense.

All kinds of activities conducted for LLL are included in the monitoring and evaluation reports. The reports are publicly available on the websites of the organisations.

#### **Conclusions**

- → The promotion of LLL is in the priority list of strategic documents to increase the participation and raise awareness.
- → The good practices and other announcements are systematically prepared intervals and broadcasted during prime time. In addition, well-known people are employed as role models for the promotion of LLL.

→ The report is also shared as open access on websites.

# IX. Professionalisation of Educators and LLL Staff

Que	stion	Answer
18.	Does the regional authority support continue professional development of:	Not applicable
	a) management staff at school?	Yes
	b) teachers?	Yes
	c) educators in informal education?	Yes

Table 10. Question 18

Professional development of employees, teachers and trainers in lifelong learning institutions are provided in numerous ways. For example, the Ministry of National Education organises trainings for the professional and lifelong learning development of teachers working in the field of lifelong learning to increase their related knowledge. However, it is necessary to increase the number of these trainings. The reason is that there are about 3900 course programmes in public education centres affiliated to the Ministry of National Education, and about 2800 of these programs are vocational programmes. Within the scope of lifelong learning, there are many teachers working in different branches in the field of vocational education. Some of the trainings for these trainers are conducted jointly through co-operation with sector partners. In addition, fairs and exhibitions for various professions are announced to teachers so that they can participate free of charge.

To ensure the participation of educators in academic studies, a number of incentives are provided, such as covering their expenses in this regard.

In addition to these, the General Directorate of Lifelong Learning of the Ministry of National Education also organises trainings from time to time for non-staff educators working in its own institutions. The main purpose of these trainings is to increase the qualifications of non-staff educators and their knowledge for lifelong learning.

#### **Conclusions**

→ To improve their abilities, the Ministry of National Education organises trainings for the professionals working in the field of lifelong learning. Alongside with that, there is a need for more training.

- → The trainings are also organized in co-operation with sector besides the free fairs and exhibitions.
- → To facilitate and encourage the participation, incentives are also taken.

# X. Promoting Demand

Que	stion	Answer
19.	Are learners financially supported to access available learning opportunities?	Yes
20.	Are there initiatives in place to support:	Not applicable
	a) learners with Special Needs?	Yes
	b) learners with migrant background?	Yes
	c) long-term unemployed?	Yes
	d) unemployed youth?	Yes
	e) unemployed women?	Yes
	f) other categories?	Yes

Table 11. Questions 19-20

Financial supports can be provided for participation in lifelong learning activities and completion of trainings. However, in addition to these, participation in the courses organized by the General Directorate of Lifelong Learning of the Ministry of National Education is free of charge. The fact that these courses are free of charge, that minimum numbers of people are not required in courses for individuals with special needs, disabled, elderly, individuals in prisons, and that these trainings can be organised in more than 1000 institutions across the country is important in terms of facilitating access to lifelong learning activities for adults. Especially recently, public education centres specifically prepared for people with disabilities over the age of 18 have aim at ensuring that they also benefit from lifelong learning activities.

Around 2000 village life centres, which were opened in 2022, continue to provide trainings especially for the long-term unemployed to gain skills that can create employment and for people close to retirement to continue production during their retirement period.

Lifelong learning activities are shaped according to demand. The demand may come from institutions and organisations or directly from the public itself. In this sense, demand is one of the most important dynamics in LLL programmes. Programs aimed at women or young people are also shaped in this context according to the needs and

demands of these masses. When evaluated in terms of gender, women are more likely to participate in lifelong learning activities. In this sense, although it is not specified for women, women can be said to benefit more from lifelong learning activities (GDLLL, 2021 Monitoring Report).

When evaluated in terms of age, it is seen that people between the ages of 24-40 participate the most. In this sense, it is not wrong to say that young people and people who are still in employment also benefit from lifelong learning activities (GDLLL, 2021 Monitoring report). In fact, the programmes preferred by these masses also point to areas where policies should be developed in the field of education and lifelong learning.

#### **Conclusions**

- → The participation in activities offered by GDLLL is always free of charge, but financial aids can be provided for people with a need.
- → LLL policy and the activities addresses all target groups such as migrants, people with disabilities, elderly people etc.
- → While there are different specific projects concentrating on specific target group/need initiated by different institutions, the demand from the masses is also one of the most important dynamics in LLL programmes.

# **XI. Online Learning**

Que	stion	Answer
21.	Is access to online learning opportunities part of the regional LLL policy?	Yes
22.	Is there a quality system for digital learning provided, implemented by regional authorities?	Yes
23.	Are learning outcomes of digital learning assessed and certified?	Yes
24.	Are there specific measures to help older or disadvantaged learners to access digital learning?	No

Table 12. Questions 21-24

Online learning has come to the forefront in lifelong learning trainings, especially after the COVID period. The General Directorate of Lifelong Learning of the Ministry of National Education has accelerated online trainings after COVID while also preparing and implementing legislation for works and procedures related to distance learning. Within lifelong learning programmes, the trainings under the title of hazardous and very hazardous work can be considered to be included in certain quality processes.

Because these trainings are provided by the General Directorate of Lifelong Learning of the Ministry of National Education, but the certification processes are conducted by VQA. These processes are conducted face to face.

Among the online trainings currently ongoing are "Hygiene trainings for employees, first aid trainings, our work is clean project trainings, distance education literacy during the epidemic period". The Ministry of National Education continues to work on this issue regarding the quality processes of online learning. In addition, there is a quality monitoring system that collects feedback on online learning systems and monitors activities monthly.

#### **Conclusions**

- → The <u>Lifelong Learning Academy</u> is an online platform that provides easy access to the lifelong learning activities from trainings to guidance and supportive documents.
- → Through <u>quality monitoring system</u>, feedbacks are collected, and the processes are evaluated systematically.
- → On the Lifelong Learning Academy, the users can also see their certificates digitally.
- → The disadvantaged groups and elderly people need further digital assistance for accessing digital learning even if there is not any specific measure. Additional attention is needed to facilitate and increase their participation.

# XII. Supporting LLL

Que	stion	Answer
25.	Is the job-related training of adults supported by regional/public financial support?	Yes
26.	Are other forms of education and training (not job related) supported by regional/public financial support?	Yes

Table 13. Questions 25-26

Information about trainings for the development of adults in the field of professional and lifelong learning is given in the previous sections. The trainings in this scope are limited to some specific fields and some target groups. For example, within the scope of some collaborations between MoNE and İŞKUR, joint courses and employment guaranteed courses can be opened with the involvement of the leading institutions of the sector in the process.

Apart from these, certain incentives are provided to ensure participation and completion of courses, especially for those under temporary protection, through project activities. In addition to trainees of these courses, incentives are also provided to increase the capacities of institutions and organisations.

#### **Conclusions**

- → Through the collaboration with İŞKUR (Employment agency), the participants may be provided with a financial support in addition to trainings. The trainings are mostly based on vocational upskilling and reskilling.
- → For the cases, in which the trainings are not employment oriented, it can be still claimed that the incentives are provided. At the same time the big portion of the trainings offered by General Lifelong Learning Directorate and Public Education Centres are free of charge.

# XIII. Valuing Learning

Question	Answer
27. Is there a validation system for all adult learning?	Yes

Table 14. Question 27

The recognition of prior learning (ÖÖT, Önceki Öğrenmelerin Tanınması) system aims to ensure the validity of the lifelong learning system in a holistic manner and the National lifelong learning system (UHBİS) aims to collect all data that can be evaluated within this scope in a single system. With the legislation on the recognition of prior learning, the execution of these works and procedures is included in the scope of the law. On the other hand, the efforts for the realisation of UHBIS are ongoing. With this system in place, the possibility of recognition of any skills that are not documented will increase.

An example of studies on the subject is the evaluation of the General Directorate of Lifelong Learning of the Ministry of National Education in adult literacy courses. Adults with literacy skills who do not have a certificate are assessed at public education centres within the scope of ÖÖT to certify their learning.

### **Conclusions**

→ For the validation, a new system is being created in the name of UHBIS with the aim of gathering all data and improving the evaluation system. Through the UHBIS

platform, the prior learning that is not certificated will be assessed and made visible in individual's accounts.

# Monitoring and evaluation

# XIV. Capacity to Evaluate Results, Progresses and Impact of Regional LLL Policies

Question	Answer
28. Is a formal evaluation for LLL policies in place at the regional level?	Yes
29. How frequently is an evaluation activity conducted?	Yes
30. Are evaluation reports publicly available?	Yes
31. Are all Stakeholders categories aware/involved in the evaluation?	Yes
32. Are evaluation results actually used to improve LLL Policies?	Yes
33. Is collaboration regularly evaluated?	Yes

Table 15. Questions 28-33

The most comprehensive reports that evaluate lifelong learning at national level are the Monitoring and Evaluation Reports of the General Directorate of Lifelong Learning (GDLLL) published by the General Directorate of Lifelong Learning of the Ministry of National Education. These reports are an important source of data in terms of monitoring and evaluating the activities conducted in various aspects in the field of lifelong learning. The data are primarily obtained from the digital data stored in the e-Yaygın system, the compilation of studies in the General Directorate's own field of duty, qualitative data obtained from field studies, the results of project activities, social and cultural activities oriented towards lifelong learning and the data of the studies carried out within the scope of cooperation. Regional, national, and international collaborations are among the topics that are subject to monitoring and the results of which are evaluated.

The evaluation reports, which are based on the analyses of the data collected under these headings, provide information on the aspects of the system that may need strengthening. In addition, MoNE's Directorate of Strategy Development, which is responsible for publishing all national education indicators or statistics, publicly publishes non-formal education statistics as well as formal education statistics.

Monitoring and evaluation reports are created at least once a year, but interim reports can also be made. The reports are publicly available. In general, the most comprehensive reports on LLL are published by TurkStat. TurkStat reports are also publicly available.

The reports are presented to researchers or those interested in the subject as well as being an important and reliable source of data for policy and decision makers. The headings in these reports sometimes contribute to the determination of policies for lifelong learning by decision-makers.

#### **Conclusions**

- → The Monitoring and Evaluation Reports of the General Directorate of Lifelong Learning are written on national base, and they consist of the most comprehensive and reliable data on lifelong learning monitoring and evaluating.
- → The reports refer to the field studies, the outcomes of projects, social and cultural activities and so on. The activities carried out by a collaboration (regional/national/international level) are included as well.
- → The reports put emphasis on the areas that need strength. Beside the interim reports, the time interval for the Monitoring and evaluation reports is one year.
- → The findings and outcomes in these reports contribute to policy making processes as a reliable source.

# Webography

### Chapter I. LLL in a Regional Development Strategy

- → MEB Aile Değerleri İçin Harekete Geçti
- → Family Education Course Program
- → Stratejik Planı 2019-2023
- → Aile Okulu Projesi Çalıştığının Açılışı Yapıldı.
- → Public Education Centres for Adult with Disabilities
- **→ Village Community Centres**
- **→** Good Practices Examples
- **→ Quality Tracking System**
- → <u>LLL Academy Distance Learning System</u>
- → <u>LLL Protocol Page</u>
- → Monitoring And Evaluation Reports of The General Directorate of Lifelong Learning

# Chapter III. Inter-Institutional Coordination and Integration of LLL Policies

- → Tüik Yaygın Eğitim Faaliyetleri Araştırmaları
- **→** Adult learning statistics
- → Eğitim İstatistikleri
- → Adult Education Survey Micro Data Set 2016
- → Adult education and training

#### Chapter V. International Comparisons, Cooperation and Learning

- → Global report on adult learning and education
- **→** Education at a Glance 2020. OECD Indicators
- → OECD "Skills Matter: Adult Skills" survey and Turkey

## Chapter VI. Managing and Sustaining Partnerships

- > Cumhurbaşkanlığı Teşkilatı Hakkında Cumhurbaşkanlığı Kararnamesi
- → On Birinci Kalkınma Planının (2019-2023)
- → Halk Eğitimi Kurslarından Yararlanan Vatandaş Sayısı, 6 Ayda 6 Milyona Ulaştı
- → Halk eğitimi kurslarından 10 ayda 10 milyonu aşkın kişi yararlandı

# Chapter VII. Information and Guidance

- → 2021 Yılı İyi Uygulama Örnekleri
- → İzleme Değerlendirme Raporları
- → Hayat Boyu Öğrenme Genel Müdürlüğü
- → Yetişkin Eğitimİ Araştırması

## Chapter VIII. Developing Learning Motivation and Skills or Creating a Culture of LLL

- → LLL strategy document 2009-2013
- → Türkiye Hayat Boyu Öğrenme Strateji Belgesi 2014-2018
- → Talim ve Terbiye Kurulu Başkanlığı
- → Ministry of National Education General Directorate of Lifelong Learning 1
- → Ministry of National Education General Directorate of Lifelong Learning 2

# Chapter IX. Professionalisation of Educators and LLL Staff

- → 'İşimiz Temiz Projesi' başlıyor
- → Tertemiz Yarınlar Okullardan Başlar
- → <u>Bilimsel Toplantılara Katılım Yönergesi</u>
- → Millî Eğitim Bakanlığına Bağlı Kurumlarda Görev Yapan Personelin Bilimsel Toplantılara Katilim Yönergesi

#### Chapter X. Promoting Demand

- → Mesleki ve Teknik Kategorisi Etkinlikleri
- → Emine Erdoğan ve Bakan Özer, Türkiye'de Yetişkin Engellilere Hizmet Veren İlk Halk Eğitimi Merkezinin Açılışını Yaptı
- → Köy Yaşam Merkezleri Köylerin Kalbi Oluyor
- → Millî Eğitim Bakanlığı Hayat Boyu Öğrenme Kurumları Yönetmeliği
- → Monitoring and Evaluation Report

# Chapter XI. Online Learning

- → <u>Millî Eğitim Bakanliği Yaygin Eğitim Kurslari Uzaktan Öğrenme Yönergesi Birinci</u>
  Bölüm
- → HBÖ Akademi Uzaktan Öğrenme Portalı

## Chapter XII. Supporting LLL

- → <u>Electronic Platform for Adult Learning in Europe</u>
- → Hayat Boyu Öğrenme Haftası

# Chapter XIII. Valuing Learning

→ Millî Eğitim Bakanlığı Önceki Öğrenmelerin Tanınması, Denklik ve Ölçme Değerlendirme İşlemleri III İlgili Usul ve Esaslara İlişkin Yönerge

# → Türkiye'nin ilk "Hayat Boyu Öğrenme ve İzleme Sistemi" kuruluyor

Chapter XIV. Capacity to Evaluate Results, Progresses and Impact of Regional LLL Policies

- → Monitoring and Evaluation Report
- → TÜİK Yaygın Eğitim Faaliyetleri Araştırmaları
- → Millî Eğitim İstatistikleri Örgün Eğitim 2021/2022

\_\_\_\_\_\_

# **Appendix**

# **Designing Policy**

Dime	ension	Question	Answer
I.	The Placing of LLL In a Regional Development Strategy / LLL in a Regional Development Strategy	<ol> <li>Is lifelong learning an important focus of the regional development plan or of the regional strategy?</li> </ol>	Yes
II.	Promoting and Implementing Democratic Governance Within the Regional LLL System	<ol> <li>Are stakeholders, learners and educators involved in the governance system of LLL (or specific education sectors)</li> </ol>	Yes
	Inter-Institutional Coordination and Integration of LLL Policies	3. Does a lifelong learning policy exist at regional level? covering all education sectors (see below)?	No
		4. Does a lifelong learning policy cover all education sectors (see below)?	Yes
l		d) formal	Yes
111.		e) informal	Yes
		f) all age groups	Yes
		5. Is there cooperation and coordination between central and regional levels?	Yes
		d) financial	Yes
		e) administrative	Yes
		f) other	Yes
IV.	Identifying Learner Needs and Monitoring Participation	6. Does the region monitor the participation rates in LLL; Does the region monitor emerging learning needs?	Yes
		7. How frequently does monitoring occur?	Yearly
		8. Are there tools and incentives to identify and communicate learning needs?	Yes

Dimension	Question	Answer
	9. Are organizations provided with tools and incentives to identify learning needs?	Yes
V. International Comparisons, Cooperation and Learning	Is the Region a member of an overarching association or network specifically focused on LLL or more specific education sectors (e.g., VET, adult learning, etc)	Yes
	11. Are exchange learning opportunities in place?	Yes
	12. Has the regional authority promoted, supported, and achieved sustainable partnerships for lifelong learning?	Yes
	13. If there are multi-stakeholder partnerships (see below):	Yes
VI. Managing and Sustaining	d) do they exist?	Yes
Partnerships	e) are they supported by regional authority?	Yes
	f) are they promoted?	Yes
	14. Are there multi-stakeholder partnerships?	Yes

# Implementation

Dimension	Question	Answer
VII. Information and Guidance	15. Is the information easily accessible to all, i.e., if stakeholders' specific needs are taken into account?	Yes
	16. Are there awareness and promotion campaigns in place to support lifelong learning?	Yes
VIII. Developing Learning Motivation and Skills or	17. Does the promotion of learning to learn cover all stages of life (see below)?	Not applicable
Creating a Yes culture of	a) children?	Yes
Lifelong Learning	b) youths?	Yes
	c) adults?	Yes
	d) seniors?	Yes
IX. Professionalisation of Educators and LLL Staff	18. Does the regional authority support continue professional development of:	Not applicable

Dimension	Question	Answer
	a) management staff at school?	Yes
	b) teachers?	Yes
	c) educators in informal education?	Yes
	19. Are learners financially supported to access available learning opportunities?	Yes
	20. Are there initiatives in place to support:	Not applicable
	a) learners with Special Needs?	Yes
X. Promoting Demand	b) learners with migrant background?	Yes
_	c) long-term unemployed?	Yes
	d) unemployed youth?	Yes
	e) unemployed women?	Yes
	f) other categories?	Yes
	21. Is access to online learning opportunities part of the regional LLL policy?	Yes
XI. Online Learning and	22. Is there a quality system for digital learning provided, implemented by regional authorities?	Yes
Digital Gap	23. Are learning outcomes of digital learning assessed and certified?	Yes
	24. Are there specific measures to help older or disadvantaged learners to access digital learning?	No
XII. Supporting Lifelong	25. Is the job-related training of adults supported by regional/public financial support?	Yes
Learning	26. Are other forms of education and training (not job related) supported by regional/public financial support?	Yes
XIII. Valuing Learning	27. Is there a validation system for all adult learning?	Yes

# **Monitoring and Evaluation**

Dimension	Question	Answer
XIV. Capacity to Evaluate Results, Progresses and	31. Is a formal evaluation for LLL policies in place at the regional level?	Yes

Dimension	Question	Answer
Impact of Regional LLL Policies	32. How frequently is an evaluation activity conducted?	Yes
	33. Are evaluation reports publicly available?	Yes
	34. Are all Stakeholders categories aware/involved in the evaluation?	Yes
	35. Are evaluation results actually used to improve LLL Policies?	Yes
	36. Is collaboration regularly evaluated?	Yes

